



**CLEARVIEW**

## **REPORT TO COUNCIL**

---

**Report Number:** CAO-003-2016

**Department:** CAO

**Meeting Date:** March 21, 2016

**Subject:** SCDSB Byng ARC Report

---

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

Be It Resolved, that Council of the Township of Clearview hereby:

- 1) Receive the SCDSB Byng ARC report for information, and;
- 2) That Council supports Option #C as listed in Schedule "A" for the Byng/Clearview Meadows/Stayner Collegiate Institute Accommodation Review.

At a Clearview Township Council meeting held on February 29, 2016 the following motion was passed.

### Recommendation:

Be It Resolved that Council of the Township of Clearview hereby:

- 1) Direct staff to provide a report regarding recommendations, information, feedback and comments to meet the school board's request of April 20<sup>th</sup>, and that a report be brought back to the March 21<sup>st</sup>, 2016 meeting for Council's approval.

As a result of the timelines that need to be met to provide a report for March 21, the time available to prepare this report was brief.

The Council direction stated that staff provide correspondence pertaining to information, feedback, and comments referencing the SCDSB review. It is the position of staff that Clearview Township has received no formal information, feedback or comments, from the public.

The SCDSB staff have been very helpful and accommodating to Clearview by providing numerous opportunities to discuss the growth plans for the municipality. The Clearview CAO attended one of the working meetings to discuss additional plans by the municipality that may affect the accommodation review.

As detailed in Schedule "A" to this report the SCDSB have considered 3 initial options for the review listed below.

### **Option A**

Status Quo;

Submit a Capital Priorities Business Case to the Ministry of Education for a replacement school (Byng Public School) and renewal and program space enhancements (Stayner Collegiate Institute).

### **Option B**

Close Byng Public School;

Close Stayner Collegiate Institute and transfer students to Collingwood Collegiate Institute and Nottawasaga Pines Secondary School;

Accommodate Byng Public School students and Clearview Elementary School Students at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and the Stayner Collegiate Institute facility;

Submit a School Consolidation Capital (SCC) business case to the Ministry of Education for renewal, and program space enhancements (Stayner Collegiate Institute) and additional pupil places (Collingwood Collegiate Institute).

### **Option C (Preferred Option)**

Close Byng Public School;

Accommodate Byng Public School students and Clearview Meadows Elementary School Students at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and Stayner Collegiate Institute in a Grade JK-6 and Grade 7-12 model;

Submit a School Consolidation Capital (SCC) business case to the Ministry of Education for addition(s), renewal, and program space enhancements.

### **COMMENTS AND ANALYSIS:**

Why Option "C"?

Staff are of the opinion that the reasons for selecting Option "C" over option "A" or "B" are obvious.

Option "A" would be preferred, however the capital investments required to replace Byng School and enhance Stayner Collegiate are unrealistic.

Option "B" would result in Clearview Township no longer having a collegiate, obviously the least favorable of all the options!

If Option "C" is selected staff have discussed what effects that decision might have on the municipal infrastructure and crossing guard staff.

The location of Clearview's crossing guards may need to be amended. All elementary children on the south side of Highway 26 and County Road 91 would have to travel north to the Clearview Meadows School.

This change may require providing assistance to children crossing Highway 26 and County 91. There are currently 2 crossing guard locations serving Byng School that will need to be reviewed.

The underground infrastructure is in place to support an expansion at the Stayner Collegiate Institute site. Additionally, sidewalk improvements in a north-south orientation may be required.

As indicated above, staff have received no formal comments from residents, developers, or any outside agencies. However, there have been numerous discussions with members of the public involving many members of staff.

Although Option "C" may be the preferred direction at this time, the majority of the discussions with the community have surrounded the legacy of the Byng School facility and property. The existing Byng School property is one of the anchors of the community, and Clearview needs to ensure that if Byng is closed, that there is a plan by the community, and the school board, to ensure that the property does not fall into disrepair.

Staff do not have any recommendations at this time detailing a possible plan for the property, however we think it is imperative that the school board act swiftly to allow options to be considered.

### **CLEARVIEW STRATEGIC PLAN:**

Obviously depending on your point of view this report may support 3.5 or totally contradict 3.5?

#### Goal 3 "Municipal Services"

3.5 Lobby other orders of government to maintain and enhance the educational opportunities in the Township

### **COMMUNICATION PLAN:**

None

### **FINANCIAL IMPACT:**

None.

### **REPORT SCHEDULES:**

Schedule "A", Report No. BF-D-2 December 2, 2015, SCDSB ARC review, Byng/Clearview Meadows/Stayner Collegiate

### **PREPARED BY:**

Stephen Sage, CAO

TO: The Chairperson and Members of the Business and Facilities Standing Committee

FROM: Superintendent of Facility Services

SUBJECT: **PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW 2015:01 – BYNG PUBLIC SCHOOL / CLEARVIEW MEADOWS ELEMENTARY SCHOOL / STAYNER COLLEGIATE INSTITUTE – INITIAL STAFF REPORT**

---

**1. Background**

In March 2015 the Board approved that a pupil accommodation review be undertaken that included Byng Public School, Clearview Meadows Elementary School and Stayner Collegiate Institute, as set out in Report BF-D-7, Capital Plan – 2014. At that time the Ministry of Education also released new Pupil Accommodation Review Guidelines and Community Planning and Partnership Guidelines. The commencement of the accommodation review was subject to the Board updating and amending its policies. On November 25, 2015 the Board approved revisions to Board Policy No. 2313 - Pupil Accommodation Review and to Board Policy No. 2345 – Community Planning and Partnerships. As part of the revised pupil accommodation policy, an initial staff report with a recommendation to commence an accommodation review is required. This report fulfills the requirements of Board Policy No. 2313 - Pupil Accommodation Review and is consistent with the Ministry of Education guidelines.

**2. Accommodation Issues Summary**

**i. Utilization**

Figure 1 illustrates the current and projected enrolment and utilization for the Stayner group of schools. In the elementary panel, enrolment is approximately 540 students and is expected to decline slightly over the next decade. In the secondary panel, enrolment is currently 330 students and is expected to slightly increase over the next decade. Overall, with the exception of an imbalance in the elementary panel, total utilization of the three schools combined is efficient.

**Figure 1: Enrolment and Utilization**

School	Capacity	Current		2020		2026	
		Students	Utilization	Students	Utilization	Students	Utilization
Stayner CI	387	330	85%	362	94%	370	96%
Byng PS	303	272	90%	270	89%	258	85%
Clearview Meadows ES	213	272	128%	267	125%	261	123%
<b>Total</b>	<b>903</b>	<b>874</b>	<b>97%</b>	<b>899</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>889</b>	<b>98%</b>

**ii. Facility Condition**

Facility condition is a significant pressure for Byng Public School and Stayner Collegiate Institute. The following summarizes the facility condition pressures that exist at all schools identified.

**REPORT NO. BF-D-2**  
**DECEMBER 2, 2015 - 2**

Byng Public School was constructed in 1922 with additions in 1971 and 1995 and is situated on a 3.4 acre site. The school has significant component renewal needs with many components nearing the end of their life cycles. The mechanical, electrical and structural systems are failing and improvements to interior finishes and the building envelope are required. Classrooms do not have sufficient electrical service available and, while minimum life safety systems are present, they do not meet the requirements of the current building code. The school is not accessible and compliance with the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) is required by 2025. Significant lighting upgrades are required and the overall learning environment is in poor condition. The five year renewal needs total approximately \$2.2 million and ten year renewal needs total approximately \$4.8 million. These figures do not include accessibility or program upgrades.

Clearview Meadows Elementary School was constructed in 2001 and is situated on a 5 acre site. Overall, the facility is in very good condition. Life safety systems meet the requirements of the current building code and the school is accessible. The five year renewal needs total approximately \$280,000 and ten year renewal needs total approximately \$1.2 million.

Stayner Collegiate Institute was constructed in 1961 with additions in 1995 and 2014 and is situated on a 14.6 acre site. A six room “port-a-pack” was added in 1987 which is in very poor condition and requires demolition. The mechanical, electrical, and structural systems are in fair condition. Life safety systems meet the requirements of the current building code and the school is accessible. Overall, the aesthetics of the facility and specialized program spaces are in poor condition and significant investment in the facility is required. The five year renewal needs total approximately \$9 million and ten year renewal needs total approximately \$10.6 million, not including program enhancements.

**iii. Program**

The significant program pressure currently being experienced in the Stayner group of schools is student retention and the effect of decreasing enrolment at Stayner Collegiate Institute. From a student retention perspective, Stayner Collegiate Institute has seen a significant and unexpected drop in students over the past several years that cannot be attributed to demographic shifts or aging grade cohorts only. For instance, in September of 2015, 115 Grade 9 students were expected to enroll at Stayner Collegiate Institute from its feeder schools while 78 is the number of Grade 9 students currently enrolled, representing 32% less students than anticipated. Although not as significant, this trend is also exhibited in the Grade 11 and 12 cohorts as well. This ongoing departure is attributed to students selecting other public and separate school board secondary schools in the Town of Collingwood and Township of Essa for program, extracurricular, and social purposes. This trend has negatively impacted the total enrolment of Stayner Collegiate Institute and is resulting in fewer program and extracurricular opportunities, further compounding the issue.

**3. Past Actions to Address Accommodation Issues**

In order to address the program and facility pressures experienced in the group of schools, a number of initiatives and actions have taken place in the past.

Stayner Collegiate Institute was involved in a pupil accommodation review in 2008/2009 that included all north and west Simcoe secondary schools. The intent of this review was to address program, utilization, and facility condition pressures for the group of schools as a whole. The accommodation review was suspended and the ARC subsequently disbanded. With the exception of Stayner Collegiate Institute, the majority of pressures on the schools involved in the accommodation review have been addressed. The identified concerns in that review have been resolved via a subsequent accommodation review and the capital priority process.

In order to address some facility condition and program pressures, some investment has been made into the infrastructure of this group of schools, particularly Stayner Collegiate Institutue. Over the past five years approximately \$1.15 million was allocated to Stayner Collegiate Institute for fire alarm upgrades, stormwater management, window replacement and Green Industries (greenhouse). Byng Public School has had washroom accessibility improvements and have been allocated approximately \$150,000 for roof replacement. Annual renewal funding for the entire board, estimated at \$7 million, does not allow for addressing all facility needs and backlogs within the group of schools.

Past program improvements, such as the addition of a greenhouse and a green industries program, an environmental specialist high skills major program, health/physical education and technological design focuses, and developing educational partnerships with community partners, have been initiated or enhanced at Stayner Collegiate Institute providing a greater breadth of specialized education choices in order to maintain and improve student retention.

In 2011 an elementary attendance area review was undertaken to better align elementary schools with secondary school boundaries. The attendance area changes resulted in transferring areas from Worsley Elementary School and Birchview Dunes Elementary School to the Stayner elementary schools.

#### **4. Accommodation Options Considered**

As outlined, the prominent pressures facing this group of schools are facility condition, program concerns, and size of enrolment at Stayner Collegiate Institute. To address these issues a number of options were analyzed and considered. The following options represent solutions that align with the board's objectives for the effective use of resources and the provision of programming that meets student needs.

##### **Option A**

- Status Quo;
- Submit a Capital Priorities Business Case to the Ministry of Education for a replacement school (Byng Public School) and renewal and program space enhancements (Stayner Collegiate Institute).

##### **Option B**

- Close Byng Public School;
- Close Stayner Collegiate Institute and transfer students to Collingwood Collegiate Institute and Nottawasaga Pines Secondary School;
- Accommodate Byng Public School students and Clearview Elementary School Students at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and the Stayner Collegiate Institute facility;

**REPORT NO. BF-D-2**  
**DECEMBER 2, 2015 - 4**

- Submit a School Consolidation Capital (SCC) business case to the Ministry of Education for renewal, and program space enhancements (Stayner Collegiate Institute) and additional pupil places (Collingwood Collegiate Institute).

**Option C (Preferred Option)**

- Close Byng Public School;
- Accommodate Byng Public School students and Clearview Meadows Elementary School Students at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and Stayner Collegiate Institute in a Grade JK-6 and Grade 7-12 model;
- Submit a School Consolidation Capital (SCC) business case to the Ministry of Education for addition(s), renewal, and program space enhancements.

**5. Preferred Accommodation Option**

The Terms of Reference outlined in Board Policy No. 2313 - Pupil Accommodation Review refer to a number of accommodation objectives to support student achievement and well-being. After detailed analysis, staff have concluded that Option C is the preferred option that most effectively addresses these issues. The following summarizes the impacts and rationale in further detail.

**i. Capital Improvements**

With a proposed closure of Byng Public School, approximately 230 new pupil places would be required to accommodate students. Ideally, a 144 pupil place addition would be constructed at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and an 84 pupil place addition, with a technology focus, would be constructed at Stayner Collegiate Institute. Additional renewal and facility upgrades would also be anticipated at Stayner Collegiate Institute to address facility condition and other programming shortfalls. This proposal would create two independent facilities, each with defined program, in a campus setting. Further engineering and design analysis is required to determine feasible options and the amount of funding received would significantly impact the ultimate design, extent, and configuration of any capital improvements. Alternative design concepts may need to be considered.

**ii. Accommodation Impacts**

As noted, the closure of Byng Public School would require the transfer of students and additional pupil places being constructed. The preferred option would result in effective utilization of the facilities and create a campus with approximately 890 total students. Figure 2 illustrates the projected enrolment and utilization of the preferred option.

**Figure 2: Option C Accommodation Impacts**

School	Capacity	2018		2020		2026	
		Students	Utilization	Students	Utilization	Students	Utilization
Clearview Meadows ES - JK-6	357	422	118%	429	120%	409	115%
Stayner CI - 7-12	471	465	99%	470	100%	480	102%
<b>Total</b>	<b>828</b>	<b>887</b>	<b>107%</b>	<b>899</b>	<b>109%</b>	<b>889</b>	<b>107%</b>

Note: Includes 144 pupil place addition to Clearview ES; 84 pupil place addition to Stayner CI

It is acknowledged that variables such as demographic shifts and expedited residential development could impact future enrolment and additional pupil places may be required. The preferred solution provides ample opportunity, with excessive acreage available, for expansion if warranted and justifiable.

### **iii. Program Impacts**

The preferred option will result in numerous program impacts. This solution would require a shift to a Grade JK-6 and Grade 7-12 model in a campus format. Capital improvements would result in updated and enhanced specialized teaching spaces for both elementary and secondary students. The grade configuration would allow Grade 7 and 8 students access to technology, arts, science, and physical health facilities and programs not normally accessible to elementary school students. Larger elementary cohorts would provide more efficient staffing allocations and minimize the occurrence of split and triple grade instances and enhance teacher professional learning communities. A Grade 7-12 component is also hoped to improve student retention due to intermediate students being exposed and integrated into a secondary setting earlier than has traditionally taken place. Program improvements would provide greater choices of specialized education opportunities that could also maintain and improve student retention and potentially attract new students. The experiences of other Ontario school boards that have moved to a Grade 7 to 12 model have reflected that programs are built up and that student retention is improved.

### **iv. Transportation Impacts**

Preliminary analysis provided by the Simcoe County Student Transportation Consortium (SCSTC) has indicated that the preferred option would result in the requirement of one additional school vehicle. The total annual approximate cost is \$42,500. This analysis is based on current addresses of students, current program related transportation arrangements, board policy, and current bus sharing and tiering arrangements. It is possible that savings could arise through a review of bell time changes which would result in run sharing/tiering opportunities on current school vehicles servicing these schools.

### **v. Funding**

Funding for the preferred option would be based on a School Consolidation Capital (SCC) business case submission to the Ministry of Education. The proposed capital investment required would be approximately \$9.9 million. In the event funding is not immediately received, the intent would be to remain with the status quo while continuing to submit a business case(s) through the annual Ministry of Education capital priority submission cycle. A comprehensive engineering and feasibility analysis is currently being undertaken for Byng Public School. In the event significant safety and component concerns of a more immediate nature are found, and that cannot be reasonably mitigated, portable accommodation at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and Stayner Collegiate Institute may be recommended prior to funding being granted.

While an addition at Clearview Meadows Elementary School and/or Stayner Collegiate Institute would result in some increased operations costs at those locations, the potential closure of Byng Public School would also result in operations, utilities and maintenance savings.

**vi. Timelines**

In order to provide sufficient time to complete the accommodation review, submit a School Consolidation Capital (SCC) business case, complete contemplated renovations, and transition to a new program delivery model, the proposed option is recommended to take effect in September 2019. Adjustment of the timelines and interim accommodation strategy may be required depending on funding approval. It is also recommended that the proposed accommodation review come to a conclusion during the 2015/2016 academic year. This is intended so that, in the event an accommodation solution is approved by the Board, the Ministry of Education School Consolidation Capital (SCC) funding program timelines can be met.

**vii. Community Planning and Partnerships**

In keeping with the previous and current Board Policy No. 2345 – Community Planning and Partnerships, board staff have begun to assess potential partnership opportunities within this group of schools. In the spring of 2015 Stayner Collegiate Institute was added to the roster of schools where partnership opportunities were being considered. In May 2015 entities on the notification list were notified. To date, no formal proposals have been received. Childcare providers have informally expressed interest in a childcare centre in the community and board staff will continue pursuing any other partnership opportunities that may arise.

Also in accordance with Policy 2345 – Community Planning and Partnerships, board staff have requested additional information from the Township of Clearview to ensure the most current municipal data is available and being utilized. Preliminary meetings between board staff and the Township of Clearview staff have occurred and are scheduled to continue.

**6. Conclusion**

The Byng Public School, Clearview Meadows Elementary School, and Stayner Collegiate Institute group of schools are experiencing significant facility and program pressures as outlined. It is the recommendation of staff to commence with a pupil accommodation review, in accordance with Board Policy No. 2313 - Pupil Accommodation Review, in order to develop a feasible and sustainable accommodation strategy that addresses these concerns.

**RECOMMENDATION**

That the Business and Facilities Standing Committee recommend that the Board approve the immediate commencement of a Pupil Accommodation Review that includes Byng Public School, Clearview Meadows Elementary School and Stayner Collegiate Institute, as set out in Report No. BF-D-2, Pupil Accommodation Review 2015:01 – Byng Public School / Clearview Meadows Elementary School / Stayner Collegiate Institute – Initial Staff Report, dated December 2, 2015.

**Respectfully submitted by:**

John Dance  
Superintendent of Facility Services

December 2, 2015